

OCTOBER 7, 2021

Law Enforcement Epidemiology Project

Alfreda Holloway-Beth, PhD Lee Friedman, PhD

UIC



Law Enforcement Epidemiology



Law enforcement epidemiology is the study of the acute and long-term effects of injuries and death during interaction action with law enforcement. It assesses mechanism and intent of injury and mortality among law enforcement, suspect, and bystander using data from electronic medical records, worker's compensation claims, and survey data.









Project

Aims

To build a comprehensive surveillance system to better characterize the magnitude of civilian and law enforcement injuries that occur each year in the U.S. and to guide policy reform that addresses police use of force tactics and strategies to build community trust in the police.



A Public Health Approach to Law Enforcement Epidemiology





Law Enforcement Epidemiology Project at the University of Illinois at Chicago

Project Goal

To provide surveillance data for the U.S., Illinois and Chicago on civilians injured during interactions with law enforcement and officers injured on the job. Because comprehensive data on civilian non-fatal and fatal injuries caused during interactions with law enforcement is lacking in the U.S., this site primarily focuses on civilian injuries.

policeepi.uic.edu

•Surveillance

• Establish an active and sustainable surveillance program that will serve as a model for other states across the country.

Objectives

Reporting

• Identify barriers to reporting.

•Analysis

• Describe long-term impacts on individuals following an injury caused by law enforcement personnel.

Recommendations

Develop policy recommendations for police reform



Public Health Surveillance Defined

The ongoing, systematic collection, analysis, and interpretation of health-related data essential to planning, implementation, and evaluation of public health practice, closely integrated with the timely dissemination of these data to those responsible for prevention and control

Adapted from: Thacker SB, Birkhead GS. Surveillance. In: Gregg, MB, ed. Field epidemiology. Oxford, England: Oxford University Press; 2008.

Problem with Existing Public Health Surveillance Data

Nationally, surveillance data relating to civilian injuries has several limitations:

- Undercounts both non-fatal and fatal cases by up to 50%+
- Police sources underestimate severity of injury
- Provide no clinical information about non-fatal injuries
- Provide no data on long-term impacts on individuals and communities
- No investment in research focusing on civilian injuries
- Little is known about risk factors and differences in control tactics because of paucity of research
- Focus is almost exclusively on firearm related deaths



Data Sources for Public Health Surveillance



Civilian Data

State & Local Data

- Ambulance
- Police Crash
- Hospital Data
- Death Records
- Media Reports
- Court & Investigation Data

National

- Ambulance
- Police Crash
- Use of Force
- Hospital Data
- Death Records
- Arrest Related Deaths
- Mortality in Correctional Institutions
- Media Reports

Law Enforcement Personnel Data

Local Data

- Police Crash Reports
- Hospital Discharge
- Worker's Compensation Data

National Data

policeepi.uic.edu

- BLS Non-Fatal Injuries
- BLS Fatal Injuries
- NIOSH Death Records
- FBI Fatality Data

UIC



Snapshot: the last 20 years of law enforcement activities in the United States





Law Enforcement Epidemiology



Enfo	orcement				
The Law Enfo framework fr nearly all U.S enforcement identifying ca	orcement Epidemiology Proje or a comprehensive surveillan , states immediately to augme . We identify useful data sour ases.	ct at the University of ce system based on e ent police reports and ces, describe their st	Illinois Chicago Sch xisting public healtl Bureau of Justice S engths and limitatio	iool o 1 data tatist ons, c	f Public Health aims to provide a a sources that can be implemented in ics data on civilians injured by law lata dictionaries and SAS code for
State a	Ind Local Level [Data			
We identify u on each tab t	seful data sources, describe t o view different resources:	heir strengths and lin	nitations, data dictio	narie	s and SAS code for identifying cases. C
Ambular Data	Police Crash Data	Hospital Data	Death Records	R	Media Court & Investigation eports Data
Preh	ospital Ambulan	ce Runs			
Participat with volur provides • State • Local munic	ing jurisdictions and agencies theer and private ambulance s a level of consistency across s level data can be acquired fro county, municipal and agency sipal fire department or private	a varies by State and I ervices. Most states tates and jurisdiction m your state departm level data can be acce a ambulance agency.	ocality. Typically mu conform with nation s. ent of public health quired by contacting	inicip nal co g the l	al fire departments participate along ding standards set by NEMSIS which ocal department of public health,
NEM	SIS V3.0 Data Dictionary 🛽				
Civili	an Injury Case Definition for	EMS data 🖄			
Illino	is Department of Public Hea	alth Contact 🛛			
Nation	al Level Data				
Ambulan	ce Data 🛛	Police Crash I	Data	12	Use of Force Data
NEMSIS con Deidentified request.	npiles national EMS data. data is available upon	NHTSA samples pe the GES sample. G upon request.	olice reports throug ES data is available	h	Police Public Contact Survey provides data on police stops, use of force and outcomes.
Hospital	Data 🛛	Death Record	s (Simple)	2	Death Records (Detailed)
			and a state in the state of the		
A national sa Go to Nonfat "Legal Interv	mple of hospitals (NEISS). al Injury Reports and select ention" cases.	Go to Fatal Injury R "Legal Intervention	cases.		Go CDC-WONDER multiple cause of death data to get more detailed information on cause.

Arrest Related Deaths Mortality in Correctional Media Reports Arrest related death (ARD) program Institutions compiles law enforcement agency reported deaths. in custody.

School of Publ

CIVILIAN DATA

Data Sources Facts and Figures

Research

Policy





School of Public Health		UI HEALTH IS UIG S ACADEMIC HEALTH ENTERPRISE					
CIVILIAN DATA	● > Data on Civilian Injuries Caused by Law Enforcement → Research	n on Injuries Caused by Law Enforcement					
Data Sources							
Facts and Figures	Research on Injuries	s Caused by Law					
Research	Enforcement						
Policy	The Law Enforcement Epidemiology Project at the University of Illinois Chicago aims to conduct novel research on risk factors and long term outcomes following an injury caused during contact with law enforcement.						
	Completed Research						
	Comprehensive Surveillance System	Comparison of National Data Systems					
	We have described a framework for a comprehensive surveillance system based on existing public health data sources that can be implemented immediately to augment police reports and data from the Bureau of Justice Statistics.	We also characterized the substantial differences in reported numbers and rates across existing federal surveillance tools.					
	High Risk Groups	Risk Among Black/African-Americans					
	We found that legal-intervention injuries had more severe outcomes and disproportionately impacted African Americans, persons with motor disabilities and individuals with psychiatric conditions.	Civilian injuries caused by law enforcement impacts all citizens in the State of Illinois, but clearly Black men are consistently and disproprionately the victims of both fatal and non-fatal injuries caused by law enforcement.					
	Risk factors associated with legal interventions 😢	A 5-Year Retrospective Analysis of Legal Intervention Injuries and Mortality in Illinois 😢					
	Heber and New Heber Incidents						
	Injuries occur across the State of Illinois and are not isolated to major urban centers.						
	Research in progress						
	Data Linkage of Multiple Datasets	Ongoing Analyses					
	To estimate the cumulative number of unique cases occurring annually we are inking data across each of the data systems used for surveillance using multi-stage probabilistic linkage methods.	Ongoing detailed analyses will continue to be conducted on available datasets describing patient demographics, exposure (mechanism of injury), circumstances leading to injury, health outcomes (diagnoses, hospital procedures, discharge status) and costs associated with medical care and lost productivity.					
	Long-Term Outcomes	Barriers to Reporting Injuries					
	Interviews of civilians injured during a legal intervition to better describe the civilians ance which led to the injury in arrest, traffic stop, police called to the scene), cost and type of medical care required. Their relationship with the difficult that was involved in the injury general changes in their relationship the incident from their properties that the relation of the incident from their properties the role of rations/big/slobuse of power, and long term changes in physical and psychological tealth. Archites of dabily long social support and home life, finances, and ability to return to work.	Interviews of medical, law enforcement and policy professionals on the process of coding and reporting of legal intervention injuries, barriers to reporting, how police mantain caudo, during the transport and treatment of these patients, athlades howneds use of frace by police among these and setter of transport and treatment of these patients, and setter of transport and treatment of the ingentiation police violence, and athlades towards civilians injured during legal intervention.					
	Validation of ICD-10 Coding						

Law Enforcement Epidemiology Project

We are validating the coding used in hospital records to verify reliability and validity of ICD-10 codes. In addition, we are evaluating the use of ICD-10 codes in reference to law enforcement personnel injuries. Initial work confirms that the majority of officers injured based on ICD-10 coding are in fact security guards assaulted on the job during robberies.

School of Public Health Q UI Health UIC.edu Campus Map UNIVERSITY OF Ulfweith UlCedu Campus Map Survey Ulfweith UlCedu Campus Map Survey Campus Map Survey Contact Law Enforcement Epidemiology Project UI HEALTH IS UIC'S ACADEMIC HEALTH ENTERPRISE School of Public Health

CIVILIAN DATA

Data Sources

Research Policy

Facts and Figures

● > Data on Civilian Injuries Caused by Law Enforcement > Policy Recommendations

Policy Recommendations

The Law Enforcement Epidemiology Project at the University of Illinois Chicago aims to utilize scientific data to inform policy decision making regarding safe policing at the municipal, county and State levels in order to eliminate non-fata and fatal civilian injuries, improve public safety and trust in law enforcement, and help make the working conditions of law enforcement safer and healthier.

One of the primary goals of this project is to enhance the public debate about current policy, develop new policy ideas and advise on implementation and evaluation of new policies. There has been a call for a paradigm shift by researchers who understand that this is a public health issue rather than solely a criminal justice problem. In turn, these researchers have called for the collection and reporting of law enforcement related injuries and deaths by public health entities, to augment current criminal justice sources.

Law enforcement related violence has proven to be in alignment with the issues that public health strives to deal with, such as social and structural determinants of health, especially the correlation between violence, socioeconomic status and race in the United States. The persistent disparity observed in the data may be attributable to policing activities that encourages profiling, harassment, and aggressive behavior towards marginalized citizens in the United States, especially African Americans and lowamong young men in urban communities (Geller, 2014).

The hope is that by implementing public health policies for active surveillance of law-enforcement-related iniuries and deaths across Departments of Public Health, the data can inform policy makers on how to best reduce or eliminate unwarranted injury system-wide.

Collaboration with key stakeholders

We are working to expand our diverse advisory board. The advisory board is composed of a diverse group of stakeholders including professionals in medicine, public health, law, community advocacy, law enforcement, local and state government (State Senators and Alderman), and public policy.

Policy paper

A major output of this project is to generate a policy paper outlining recommendations to reduce the incidence of legal intervention injuries by focusing on root causes. The surveillance data can inform the following key policy issues:

- Mandatory reporting of use of force and resulting injuries to an independent agency
- · Publish data publicly on all egregious cases of civil rights violations and repeat offenders
- · Establish independent agencies to receive, investigate and adjudicate all complaints of civil rights violations with the power to discipline/fire/initiate criminal proceedings
- · Extend protections from retaliation for civilians who file complaints to 10 years from the date of complaint
- Evaluate recruitment and screening strategies for new cadets
- · Assess implementation of novel non-lethal tactics and evaluate existing non-lethal techniques
- Develop ongoing training programs for officers involving unconscious bias and how to interact with disabled, intoxicated and mentally ill persons.
- · Assess officer burnout and PTSD, and provide rotations out of difficult positions/precincts
- Eliminate arrest/citation/summons quotas
- · Extend whistleblower protections to 10 years from the date of complaint for officers (current law protects officers for 30-90
- Add data on civilian complaints, suits, injuries and deaths to annual performance reviews of officers, supervisors and commanders
- Provide law enforcement personnel commensurate salaries for 40 hours of work (without having to work overtime)

 Establish a non-law enforcement emergency response unit to respond to 911 calls relating to persons with mental health
conditions and non-violent complaints based on social work models (similar to Fire Department EMT response). These first responders would be called to scenes involving drug use, public disturbances, vagrancy, loitering, vandalism and other nonviolent violations.





LAW ENFORCEMENT

Data Sources

Research

Snapshot: During the most recent year of complete data, in 2018 law enforcement suffered...



Law enforcement has been regularly ranked as one of the ten most dangerous occupations in the United States, specifically for correctional and police officers (US Bureau of Labor Statistics). Each existing data system provides different picture of the risk law enforcement face while on the job.

sible version of the law enforcement officer injuries graphic

Department of hostice data estimates that approximately 18,000 officers suffer injuries after being assaulted on the job ach year. Of the officers who are assaulted, approximately 00 are fetoriously sited by civilians with another 40 killed accidentally (e.g. mdorr vehicle collisions or being struck by vehicle). Studies have shown that officers are more likely to suffer injuries when they use force (Herrique; 1996; Smith; 2002; Alpert 2004).

Neverine, data shows that low information personnel are for more likely to suffer injuries and literases through nor-violent mean write enducting require job datas. According to the burst of Labor Statistics, in 2018, 138 allow enforceme data on the job, not the 60 reported by the FB. Of the deshin reported on the Cansus of Hald Occupational liquides (Burses) of hansportation incodents.

The Bureau of Labor Statist The Brease of Labor Statistics also also with 44.6,270 law enforcement personnel anti-end systems and theses that resulted in Jalars and (2) points offers the second base of the system of the system of the system of the system of the evaluation worker's compensation data show that must of these non-vicent inputs are caused by fails, motor vehicle crashes, externments and must result and any system of the systems of the systems of the systems of the systems of the evaluation worker's compensation data show that must of these non-vicent inputs are caused by fails, motor vehicle crashes externments and must need that personnel data base.

Available Information

The surveillance system we developed utilizes multiple data systems which provides clarity and details that no single system contains because of reporting barriers. Surveillance systems serve as the cornerstone of public health policy by providing timely, representative and accurate data on a given size. This helps policy makers prioritize issues.

The Law Enforcement Epidemiology Project at the University of Illinois Chicago provides reports and fact sheets relating to law enforcement safety in four areas:



Provide a funework for a comprehensive surveillance system based on existing unkits health data surverse that an be implemented in many all U.S. States in modelately. While the Brussian of Labor Statestics and Brussian of Labor Statestics provide excellent highly data for law enforcement personnel, they are restricted primarily to injurise caused by assault. We ain the segand utilization of state works: compression during that — First Regords of highly and Calmas Labor solutions to the provide and the segand utilization of state works: compression during that — First Regords of highly and Calmas Labor in order to provide daily basis. Since law enforcement personnel are more likely to suffer workplace injuries through non-violent means, it is critical to examine existing systems that provide the dails



Falls and Motor Vehicles are Most Common Causes of Injury



Injurio la la la endorcement personnel de primerily acuadel la nomiolent many, out 5% to 1% of bujuris acuade la visacità scrissi the fue subpropues la vertorement personnel: Correctional Officers, Municipal Police, Brentff, and State Police. Pal relata ci njuris versi the mast common cause of njury in al adaptado, no engola engola esta common cause of njury in al adaptado, no engola esta company, and a subproprime from fails and we most likely to be injured by another ventorecity to ter njured from fails and the most likely to be injured by another ventorecity on a cash.

Permanent Disability and Lost Days of Work

Municipal police officers had the highest median ratings of permanent partial disability, while Shertff's Officers loat the most days of work following a workplace injury. Across all law enforcement subgroups in those with permanent disability, the mean percent permanent partial disability was over 10%, primarily involving the extremities. Read Full Study 12



Distinct Occupations in Law Enforcement



While our research demonstrates similarities between the main four subgroups of law enforcement personnel, there are distinct differences in demographic damages and the second second

Read Full Study 14

Summary of National Data

Below are data files that provide summarized data from some of the data sources listed above

Employment Data

Employment Data The Bureau of Labor Statistics collects data on employment and wages through the Occupational Employment Statistics (OES) program. The data file provides mid-2019 year employment estimates for law enforcement and mean annual earny by occupation autorgrame.

Law Enforcement Employment Numbers in U.S. 12 Bureau of Labor Statistics Data Online 12

NOMS Death Record Data

Notify the second secon

Non-Fatal and Fatal Injury Trend Data

Non-rata and rata injury irend bata The Department of Justice and Bureau of Labor Statestice information of the statestice of the statestice of the enforcement personnel. The Department of Justice data predominately focuses on injuries caused through violent types of injuries and specifically on injuries resulting in los days of work of ratal injuries.

Law Enforcement Non-Fatal and Fatal Injury Trends 🖄 Department of Justice Data Online 🖄 Bureau of Labor Statistics Data Online 🖄





Some Definitions



Law Enforcement Epidemiology – Intent of Injury



ICD 9- E970-979

injuries inflicted by the police or other law-enforcing agents, including military on duty, in the course of arresting or attempting to arrest lawbreakers, suppressing disturbances, maintaining order, and other legal action legal execution

ICD 10 - Y35

•any injury sustained as a result of an encounter with any law enforcement official, serving in any capacity at the time of the encounter, whether on-duty or off-duty. Includes: injury to law enforcement official, suspect and bystander



Civilian Data - Results





National Data

Based on Bureau of Justice Statistics, each year:

- 50 million persons have contact with law enforcement personnel during traffic stops, street stops, arrests, crashes, or residential calls.
- 15% of these events involve threat of or use of force
- Estimated 250,000 civilians are injured annually
- 80,000 of these injuries are treated in hospitals



National Data





Illinois Data

Based on data from our surveillance project, each year in Illinois:

- 10-20 deaths
- 70-100 serious injuries
- 1000 injuries requiring treatment in a hospital
- Less than 25% are taken into custody after discharge.



Legal Intervention by Sex & Age Group in Illinois from 2016-2020







Legal Intervention by Race & Ethnicity in ILLINOIS from 2016-2020

Crude Average Annual Hospitalization Rate per 100,000, Illinois



- The rate of fatal and nonfatal injury involving African Americans is consistently 5-12x higher than all other groups, including:
- Women
- Non-urban areas
- Across age groups



Disproportionate Impact on Low Income Communities

In Illinois, nearly 80% of individuals injured during encounters with law enforcement are uninsured or covered by Medicaid. These are proxies for low income in medical data systems. Among all patients, <30% are uninsured or have Medicaid.

This corresponds with national data showing that police activity is concentrated disproportionately in low income communities, as are police stops, search and seizures, arrests, charges and imprisonment.



Legal Intervention Cause of Injury 2016-2020



- Firearms
- Explosives
- Gas
- Blunt Objects batons, flashlights
- Piercing Instrument
- Blows or Manhandling

- In non-fatal cases, nearly all cases do not involve firearms.
- For fatal cases, 85% involve the discharge of a firearm (CDC data).



Legal Intervention Injuries, Illinois 2016-2020

- For every fatal injury there are 60-80 nonfatal cases
- Injuries primarily involve the head or upper extremities.
- 13% suffer traumatic brain injury



Illinois

Legal Intervention Injury Trends by Region





Legal Intervention Risk Factors

Rate of injury is nearly equivalent across three main regions – Chicago, Suburban Cook County and the rest of Illinois.

• This is not exclusively a problem with Chicago Police as frequently claimed.

Risk factors identified across all of Illinois include:

- Residents of lower income communities
- Black / African-American residents
- Persons with substance use disorders
- Persons diagnosed with psychosis or major depression
- Persons with paralysis and neurological disorders
- Summer months



Brief Research Highlight: Law Enforcement Personnel

In addition to research focusing on civilian injuries, we conduct occupational health research to identify risk factors and safety controls to reduce injuries among law enforcement personnel.

In Illinois,

- 80% of injuries caused by preventable non-violent sources
- Correctional officers have highest risk of occupational injury
- Median days of lost work 10-12 days
- Most common causes of injury are falls, motor vehicle crashes, overexertion, being struck by or caught between objects.
- Most injuries involve extremities
- Most officers suffer substantial permanent disability
- Safety controls exist, they just need to be implemented!







History of Applying for Funding to Development a System to Track Acute and Long-term Effects of Legal Interventions

Date of Submission	Agency	Amount Requested	Amount
2016	Portes Foundation	\$40,529.00	Not Funded
2016	Robert Wood Johnson Foundation	\$204,964.00	Not Funded
2017	Joyce Foundation	\$204,964.00	Not Funded
2017	Polk Brothers	\$204,964.00	Not Funded
2018	Public Welfare Foundation	\$72,000.00	Not Funded
2018	Cook County Health & Hospitals System	\$200,000.00	Not Funded
2018	Charles Koch Foundation	\$58,975.00	Not Funded
2018	Alphawood Foundation	\$40,529.00	Not Funded
2018	Center for Health Equity Research	\$50,000.00	Not Funded
2018	Civilian Office of Police Accountability	No funding available	Not Funded



Current and Future Research

Expand surveillance model to other states – MN, MI, IN, WI

Partnering with other researchers that focus on different elements using law enforcement data sources – Center Policing Equity

Research on long term effects of injuries on civilians

Stakeholder interviews regarding barriers to reporting civilian injuries

Expanding research on correctional officers and security officers



New Insights Provided by Surveillance System

New Insights: Current data systems are limited and focus on fatal incidents. Our surveillance system has shown that for every death, there are approximately 60-80 non-fatal injuries that require treatment in a hospital, and an additional 50 injuries that do not require hospital care. We have used our surveillance system to:

Link datasets to evaluate underreporting of fatal cases, describe clinical outcomes following crashes involving police vehicles, and quantify the universe of civilian injuries.

Provide current and accessible data to stakeholders that is easy to use and interpret.

Assess temporal trends across jurisdictions and incidence data by ZIP code, including data on ethnic disparities.

Highlight the severity of non-fatal incidents, including the large proportion of traumatic brain injuries.

Enumerate the disproportionate burden on African-Americans.

Demonstrate that equivalent high rates of injury persists outside of major urban centers.

Identify various risk factors for injury, and correlate mechanism of assault with severity of injury.

Describe research needs relating to safer control tactics, efficacy of de-escalation tactics, and long-term adverse outcomes on affected individuals and communities.